

Bookreview

Patricia WITTS*

Mustafa Şahin (editor), *III Uluslararası Türkiye Mozaik Korpusu Sempozyumu Bildirileri – The Proceeding of III International Symposium of the Mosaic of Turkey*, Uludağ University, Bursa, 2007, 222 pages including 64 pages of plates in colour and black and white. ISBN 978-975-6149-32-4.

Mustafa Şahin (editor), *IV Uluslararası Türkiye Mozaik Korpusu Sempozyum Bildirileri, “Geçmişten Günümüze Mozaik Köprüsü” – The Proceedings of IV International Mosaic Corpus of Türkiye, “The Mosaic Bridge from Past to Present”*, Uludağ University, Bursa, 2008, 247 pages including 448 plates in colour and black and white and 57 figures. ISBN 978-975-6149-43-0.

These two books represent the first volumes in the Uludağ University Mosaic Research Center Series 1. They publish the papers given at two symposia held in Turkey but with an international attendance: the first took place at Bursa in June 2006, and the second was held at Gaziantep in June 2007.

These symposia owe their origins to a small gathering of Turkish and international scholars who met in Istanbul in 2004. They came together again the following year at Altinoluk, and later that year the creation of AIEMA Turkey was announced. The formation of a Turkish branch of AIEMA (*l’Association internationale pour l’étude de la mosaïque antique*) is welcome evidence of the commitment to Turkish mosaic studies. The President of AIEMA Turkey is Prof. Dr Mustafa Şahin, the driving force behind the Mosaic Research Center at Uludağ University and the editor of these volumes.

By the time of its 2006 meeting, the Turkish mosaic symposium had attracted 27 archaeologists and conservators from seven countries. The 2007 conference exceeded all expectations, being attended by 178 participants from 12 countries (including Turkey). This level of attendance attests to the great interest in Turkish mosaics and is well served by these publications which have appeared with impressive and commendable speed.

The volume of the 2006 proceedings is of smaller dimensions than its later counterpart, which has an A4-sized format. It contains 104 colour illustrations and 69 illustrations in black and white, while the volume devoted to the 2007 proceedings contains 406 colour illustrations plus 42 illustrations in black and white, supplemented by 57 figures, many of them in colour. For publications appealing to an international, multi-lingual audience, the generous provision of illustrations is exceptionally helpful. Many of the plates in the earlier volume are of small size, and while some of the plates in the later volume are also small it is pleasing to note that many are much larger: this adds considerably to the usefulness and attractiveness of the books.

The volume of the 2006 proceedings contains 18 papers, of which nine are in English, eight in Turkish and one in German. With two exceptions, all the non-Turkish papers have an abstract in Turkish, and with only one exception all the Turkish papers have an English abstract. The volume of the 2007 proceedings, reflecting the increased scale of the symposium, contains 31 papers, of which 13 are in English and 18 in Turkish. Each paper has an abstract in the other language. Both volumes start with an introduction by Prof. Dr. Mustafa Yurtkuran, the Rector of Uludağ University, which appears both in Turkish and English. They also contain a foreword in Turkish by Prof. Dr Mustafa

* 24 Elm Lodge Road, Wraxall, Bristol, BS48 1JG, UK.

Şahin and Prof. Dr Selçuk Kirli; the later volume contains an English translation of its foreword.

The volume of the 2006 proceedings begins with a text in English of the opening speech of the symposium, given by the Vice-Rector of Uludağ University, Prof. Dr Erdal Emel, in which he stressed the importance of conservation and explained the university's interest in this topic, which has culminated among other measures in the establishment of its Mosaic Research Center. The main papers begin with Mustafa Şahin's review of the history of the foundation of the Center. This is illustrated by photographs of the participants at the previous meetings, showing that the commitment to history extends to recording the history of these symposia – something that should prove fascinating to scholars in years to come. There then follows a summary of the general state of mosaic research in Turkey in 2005 by David Parrish of Purdue University in the USA, one of the distinguished international scholars who have been involved with these symposia from the outset. He explains that new discoveries, especially from Zeugma but also from Çiftlik, Antandros and Metropolis, have led to an acceleration of interest in the mosaics of Turkey. He outlines the project to create a bilingual corpus to further that interest and to disseminate material, and he sets out the detailed form the corpus will take.

There follow papers by Derya Şahin on mosaic terminology, Yusuf Oğuzoğlu on the history of the Bursa region, and Anne-Marie Manière-Lévêque and Marie-Pat Raynaud on the Corpus of the mosaics of Xanthos, which will be the first new publication in the corpus project.

Subsequent papers deal with new discoveries: at a basilica of the late fifth-century at Büyük Orhan in the borough of Bursa by Recep Okçu, and the distinctive mosaics of Edessa (Urfa), many of them from funerary contexts, by Barış Salman. Emine Tok discusses early Byzantine mosaics at Gara Church near Bodrum, Veronika Scheibelreiter traces stylistic developments in the mosaics of western Asia Minor, and Emel Aksoy addresses stylistic considerations in the Severan mosaics of Antioch. Ayşe F Erol looks at the relationship between the Muses and the technique called *opus musivum*.

There follow a number of papers relating to the protection and conservation of mosaics: Birol Can on an early church at Altintepe/Erzincan, and Mustafa H Sayar and Şehrişül Yeşil on the mosaics of Cilicia. Celal Küçük and N Mine Yar analyse four different lifting methods used for the mosaics of Zeugma and list the advantages/disadvantages and implications of each. They make the point that photographs taken of mosaics before lifting may not be sufficient for the precise demands of conservation even if they are adequate for archaeological research.

Papers concerning national corpora follow. A paper by Maria de Jesus Duran Kremer, Miguel Pessoa and Fátima Abraços on the inventory, risk map and corpus of the Roman mosaics of Portugal urges that conservation and study should be followed by diffusion of information. Sophie Delbarre, Michel Fuchs and Claude-Alain Paratte stress the need for a corpus to be updated regularly, arguing that V von Gonzenbach's 1961 publication of Swiss mosaics (*Die römischen Mosaiken der Schweiz*, Basel) is no longer sufficient. They pose some problems concerning the concept of a corpus, while demonstrating the varied uses to which it can be put, such as comparing patterns within corpora for neighbouring countries and reflecting on figurative mosaics. Hande Kökten explains how the mosaic corpus of Turkey will be distinctive from other corpora in that





the information about each mosaic will include the state of its preservation. H  l  ne Morlier and Marie-Patricia Raynaud address editorial questions concerning the Turkish corpus and remind us of the many practical issues relating to publication that need to be considered.

The volume of the 2007 proceedings follows the theme of the conference, ‘The Mosaic Bridge from Past to Present’, and groups the papers under three categories: ancient mosaics (with nine papers in Turkish and 10 in English), restoration (with five papers all in Turkish), and modern mosaics (with four papers in Turkish and three in English).

In the ancient mosaics section, Nurten Aydemir, Seil okoğullu and Nedim Derviřođlu describe the rescue excavations that took place between late 2006 and early 2007 at Halepli Bahe in Urfa. Among the discoveries were fragments with charming depictions of ducks, and a spectacular panel showing a number of Amazons on foot and on horseback hunting wild beasts. Christophe Bailly, H  l  ne Morlier and Mich  le Tahri describe plans to make the bibliographies contained in the AIEEMA Bulletins available online and discuss the considerations involved in this project. Fatima Bulgan explains how the 1,500 square metres of mosaic found at Zeugma necessitated the construction of a new museum to display these finds. She outlines how the museum in Gaziantep was created, and she evaluates the project from the perspective of museology. Rescue excavations by the Hatay Museum in 2006 at the ancient site of Issos and in the Harbiye district of Antakya are described by  mer elik. At the former, a large mosaic was found in a tepidarium depicting Artemis engaged in a hunt, while at the latter busts of Okeanos and Anosis were uncovered.

Sophie Delbarre, Michel Fuchs and Claude-Alain Paratte adopt a thematic approach, evaluating depictions of Achilles on Skyros in mosaics throughout the Roman empire. They examine the architectural contexts and consider reasons why this subject proved so popular. Rifat Erge reflects on the excavation and lifting of mosaics at Zeugma in the period from 1992 to 1999. Zaraza Friedman gives an exposition of ship iconography in mosaics, explaining how the depictions aid our understanding not just of different types of vessel but also of the sailing environment – river, lake, delta, harbour or open sea – and of sea-borne trade.

Werner Jobst outlines the conservation work undertaken during the Istanbul Great Palace Mosaic Project. He has been heavily involved in this project, and he stresses the need for ongoing care and maintenance. Maria de Jesus Duran Kremer highlights the plight of the Roman villa at Abicada in Portugal. Mehmet  nal of Gaziantep Museum describes the excavation in 2000 of the Euphrates House at Zeugma, which produced a number of figured mosaics that are now on display in the museum. He draws attention to ancient repairs, and remarks that some fragments of mosaic had fallen from an upper storey, demonstrating that the use of mosaics was not confined to the ground floor.

David Parrish discusses genre imagery of children’s games and of labouring peasants in the Great Palace mosaic at Istanbul. Among the comparative material he cites are two other mosaics from that site that are now stored elsewhere. The focus of Birte Poulsen’s paper is a geometric design found in a late-antique house at Halikarnassos which has been called a ‘signature pattern’ of a mosaic workshop based on the island of Kos.

Miguel Pessoa outlines the considerations being taken into account in the construction of protective covers for the mosaics at the Roman villa of Rabaçal in Portugal. Marie-Patricia Raynaud explains how a study of the mosaics of the East Basilica at Xanthos has provided a better knowledge of the chronology of the Basilica and of the vicissitudes to which it was subjected. Barış Salman's paper on the Edessa mosaics describes how the funerary mosaics were an early equivalent of a family photograph and also highlights a group of Orpheus mosaics.

Inspired by the discovery of the use of gold-glass tesserae in the crown worn by Dionysos in a mosaic at Ephesus, Veronika Scheibelreiter considers the use of gold tesserae throughout the Roman empire. Derya Şahin reviews the popular figure of Tethys, aiming to eliminate the confusion that often exists between Tethys and Thetis.

The ancient mosaics section ends with Emine Tok's discussion of the mosaics in a church at Çağlayanköy near Manisa and Turgut H. Zeyrek's presentation of the mosaics discovered in 2006 at Besni in the region known as Kommagene.

In the restoration section, the paper by Ali Akin Akyol and Yusuf Kağan Kadioğlu on the mosaics of the Torba Monastery complex near Bodrum emphasises the importance of analysing the materials used in a mosaic in order to find a reliable, long-lasting method of conservation. Stressing the importance of using a common language, Hande Kökten outlines the criteria to be used when creating the database of the condition of Turkish mosaics, dividing them into three main categories: mosaics in situ, exhibited in museums, and those to be lifted and stored. The different methods of exhibiting the Zeugma mosaics in the Gaziantep Museum are explained by Celal Küçük. Y. Selçuk Şener sounds a cautionary note in his review of conserved mosaics from various sites throughout Turkey, emphasising that approaches to conservation that are thought appropriate at the time might later prove to be deleterious. Mine Yar's paper ends the restoration section by discussing the Gaziantep Mosaic School within the context of increasing the region's tourism potential.

The section devoted to modern mosaics opens with a paper by Asker Ali Abiyev, Rifat Ergeç and Münteha Şahan in which mathematical methods are used to analyse geometric designs. This is followed by a description of ethnomathematics by Meltem Ceylan Alibeyoğlu and Yelda Şişman Gökalp. This discipline examines the relation between mathematics and culture. It is being applied to the Zeugma mosaics to help school pupils with their studies and to give them an understanding of their cultural heritage. Gülten Akyan adopts a philosophical approach in a paper entitled 'Being a Patented Country in Mosaic'.

Mosaic artist Elaine M. Goodwin discusses how a profound understanding of the Roman use of materials can inspire contemporary artists. Ayşegül Güvenir compares the work of two modern masters, the Russian artist Boris Anrep who worked in London, and the Turkish artist Bedri Rahmi Eyüboğlu who worked in Istanbul. Luciana Notturmi explains how artists who have a deep knowledge of ancient mosaic technique can go on to break the rules and open themselves to fresh artistic expression. Finally, Hakan Pehlivan outlines a project by pupils to create mosaic panels for their school, decorating them with images of wildlife that the pupils had seen in Roman mosaics.

All too often, mosaic studies focus either on scholarly evaluation of the figures and patterns on the pavements or on their conservation. It is particularly admirable that these volumes, as did the original symposia, bring together both

aspects. Indeed, they go further, for they contain thoughtful critiques of how to record and present information in corpora, how best to display mosaics to the public in museums, and how mosaics can be used in tourism and education as well as being a vibrant and enduring medium for modern art.

These two volumes are ambitious in their attempt to communicate with a multilingual audience, and it has been a wise decision to use a large number of illustrations. Even without reading the text, there is much to enjoy in the pictures of new discoveries and to appreciate in the photographs showing the mosaics as they were in situ and as they now are in museums. It is unlikely that many readers will be fluent in both Turkish and English, but the spread of papers between the two languages ensures a good balance. This reviewer is not qualified to comment on the Turkish abstracts of the English-language papers, but the information contained in the English abstracts of the Turkish papers varies greatly in its usefulness, as does the clarity of expression. But the achievement in making little-known or newly-discovered Turkish mosaics available to a wide readership and in bridging many gaps – between ancient and modern mosaics, archaeology and conservation, professionals and enthusiasts – outweighs the difficulties inherent in a project such as this. This new series represents a significant contribution to mosaic studies and deserves to be warmly welcomed.